

Cocktails SEVENTY WHISKEYS 20 BEERS ON TAP SINCE 1997

ERROR BAR

Making SST data sets for climate

John Kennedy, Nick Rayner

Fiducial Reference Temperature Measurements NPL, Teddington, 16 October 2017

F11AAA11AA1A1A1 276 6 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 46206 01001 99488 /1260 46/// /1 14 10068 40235 57019 22200 00079 11205 70026 333 91217 2012 1 1 0 4875 33374 0225 362553 100912 20 113 165 17586794103 7 11FFF 499 0 ZZYY01010120120120099 62553 01012 0000/ 748754 026258 6113/ 11119 40091 52002 22219 00113 444 20130 01012 0000/ 50101 80140 80019 F1AAAA1AAA1AAA1 /015 2012 1 1 165 16583792103 5 2F111 111AAA11A 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 XXXX 01004 99487 71235 46/// /14 3 10049 2 2012 1 1 - 30 22885 5AA 4 135 8 8 165 17388792103 5 11111 111111111 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 XXXXXX 01004 99487 70487 41598 8 615 10010 2012 1 1 57 165 17384794103 7 **11FFF** F1AAAA1AA 3/ 11119 40257 52010 22219 00057 444 20130 01012 0000/ 50101 80136 80024 /015 2012 1 1 109 1 126 77 165 17682793103 6 11111 111444114 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 62029 01004 99487 70125 46/// /2 21 10128 2012 1 1 1 79 88 165 16483793103 6 21111 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 46036 01001 99484 71339 46/// /1 F11AAA11A 09 10087 2012 1 1 31 165 16583792103 5 2E111 111AAA11A 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 XXXX 01004 99484 71234 46/// /08 6 10054 20051 TOLD, STORE 1,1,1, ST,1, ELLOS ST,1, LITT, 2012 1 1 0 4839 23526 0325 5TTIW1 0 904118 102548 10 49 165 1658479510313 2F111 F11AAA11AAAAAA1 31 276 6 4 99 0 CMAN01010120120099 01004 TTIW1 46/// /0923 10049 40 54 58010 90000 333 91226 555 11021 22022 32351 410030 62359 093023 093022 092020 099019 099019 098019 2012 1 1 0 4832 23716 0325 55ISW1 01104 57 102856 11 51 165 1658279510313 2F111 F11AAA11AAAAAA1 31 276 6 4 99 0 CMAN01010120120099 01004 SISW1 46/// /1111 10051 40 85 56011 90000 333 91212 555 11011 22011 32338 411019 62359 107012 111015 10 2012 1 1 0 4822 27163 0325 5PILM4 01504 82 100818 13 12 1F111 F11AAA11AAAAAA1 31 276 6 4 012 39 23 40081 58013 90000 333 91218 555 11015 22016 32357 416020 62359 156016 164 2F111 2012 1 1 0 4820 23650 03 023 2MASKSTID 0 904 62 98 2102704 0 610 1111A11111A1AA1 276 12 4 98 709 2 10061 20010 40270 54000 7//22 83/78 22223 0//// 2//// 3//// 4//// 5//// 6/ 2012 1 1 0 4810 23730 03 0 346111 01301 70 102756 15 59 21111 F11AAA11AA1AAA1 276 6 /// /1 07 10059 40275 56015 90000 22200 00052 2012 1 1 0 4794 19912 0225 346589 101322 120 21FFF F1AAAA1AAA1AAA1 499 0 ZZYY01010120120099 46589 01012 0000/ 747937 160878 80140 0017 9/015 2012 1 1 0 4787 27069 0325 5R0AM4 01404 77 100538 13 1FF11 F11AAA1AAAAAAA1 31 276 6 4 /// 39 02 40053 58013 90000 333 91216 555 11013 22014 32331 413018 62359 138016 135 2F111 2012 1 1 0 4768 23551 0325 5DESW1 0 804 31 102576 11 59 F11AAA11AAAAAA1 31 276 6 4 059 40 57 56011 90000 333 91207 555 11006 22006 32316 412012 62359 098008 107009 11 2012 1 1 0 4766 23756 0325 5WPOW1 0 304 31 102806 20 61 2E111 111AAA11A1AAAA1 31 276 6 4 99 0 CMAN01010120120099 01004 WPOW1 46/// /0306 10061 21 01 40280 56020 90000 333 91207 555 11006 22006 32357 403007 62359 030006 023006 024004 009004 330003 309001 2012 1 1 0 4760 30090 03 014 2MASKSTID 01004103 102283 1 -6 -9 А 165 17279792103 5 1F111 311AAA11A1A8AA1 276 6 99 0 BBXX01010120120099 XXXX 01004 99476 70591 46/// /10 0 11006 21009 40228 53001 7//// 8//// 22214 0//// 2////



The subtle dangers of quality control

Met Office Hadley Centre

The (less) subtle dangers of quality control







Huang, B., P.W. Thorne, V.F. Banzon, T. Boyer, G. Chepurin, J.H. Lawrimore, M.J. Menne, T.M. Smith, R.S. Vose, and H. Zhang, 2017: <u>Extended Reconstructed Sea</u> <u>Surface Temperature</u>, <u>Version 5 (ERSSTv5): Upgrades</u>, <u>Validations, and Intercomparisons</u>. *J. Climate*, **30**, 8179– 8205, <u>https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-16-0836.1</u>

www.metoffice.gov.uk



The subtle dangers of quality control



Background field



The complicated structures of systematic error

Measurement Methods





Evolution of the observing system

Fraction of Measurements from each Type in ICOADS





In situ biases

Differences between measurement methods are large

- Occasionally greater than 0.5C
- Geographically varying biases in both
- Metadata assignment is not certain





Ensembles to represent complex uncertainties





Huang, B., P.W. Thorne, T.M. Smith, W. Liu, J. Lawrimore, V.F. Banzon, H. Zhang, T.C. Peterson, and M. Menne, 2016: <u>Further Exploring and Quantifying Uncertainties for Extended Reconstructed Sea Surface Temperature (ERSST)</u> <u>Version 4 (v4).</u> *J. Climate*, **29**, 3119–3142, <u>https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-15-0430.1</u>

www.metoffice.gov.uk

Met Office Hadley Centre

A Call for New Approaches to Quantifying Biases in Observations of Sea Surface Temperature

Kent et al. (2017) BAMS https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-15-00251.1

Recommendations

- 1: Add more data and metadata to ICOADS
- 2: Reprocess existing ICOADS records
- 3: Improve information on observational methods.
- 4: Improve physical models of SST bias.
- 5: Improve statistical models of SST bias.
- 6: Maintain and extend the range of different estimates of SST bias
- 7: Expand data sources for validation and extend use of measures of internal consistency in validation.
- 8: Ensure adequacy and continuity of the observing system.
- 9: Improve openness and access to information.





AVHRR data



www.metoffice.gov.uk

Met Office

Hadley Centre

© Crown Copyright 2017, Met Office



SST CCI error propagation

Propagating uncertainty to large scales yields depends strongly on the assumed correlation structure.

Using L4 data with assumed 1-day, 100 km correlations

"This estimate is arguably too small and indicates that systematic uncertainties operating at larger scales are present"

Uncertainty propagation in observational references to climate model scales (2017) Bellprat Massonnet Siegert Prodhommea Macias-Gómeza, Guemas, Doblas-Reyes. **Remote Sensing of Environment** <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2017.06.034</u> Observational uncertainty Niño3.4 SST



www.metoffice.gov.uk



Optimal methods in a suboptimal world

"Assuming the errors are uncorrelated and normally

distributed"

To learn the magic words read:

Karspeck, A. R., Kaplan, A. and Sain, S. R. (2012), Bayesian modelling and ensemble reconstruction of mid-scale spatial variability in North Atlantic sea-surface temperatures for 1850–2008. Q.J.R. Meteorol. Soc., 138: 234– 248. doi:10.1002/qj.900

Ilin, A., and A. Kaplan (2009), Bayesian PCA for reconstruction of historical sea surface temperatures, in Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Neural Networks (IJCNN 2009), pp. 1322–1327, Atlanta, U.S.A, doi:10.1109/JJCNN.2009.5178744.



Non-Gaussian distributions

1-7 June 2006

Requirements usually a number interpreted as a standard deviation

A different way to think of requirements is probability of exceeding a particular error threshold



Assume normal and uncorrelated

© Crown Copyright 2017, Met Office

www.metoffice.gov.uk



Correlated errors

Assume the errors ARE correlated Computationally challenging but possible See the EUSTACE poster





© Crown Copyright 2017, Met Office



Validation without validation data



Validation without validation data

No **long-term** silver(ish)-standard reference datasets

- Maybe Argo
- SST CCI stability only assessed in Tropical Pacific thanks to TAO array (Merchant et al. 2012)
 Have to rely on:
- Intercomparisons
- Multiple data set creation attempts, structural uncertainty (Thorne et al. 2005)
- Comparison with physically related variables (also potentially problematic)
- Experiments: buckets in laboratories (Carella et al 2017) and students on ships (Matthews and Matthews 2013)



E.C. Kent, N.A. Rayner, D.I. Berry, M. Saunby, B.I. Moat, J.J. Kennedy, D.E. Parker (2013) Global analysis of night marine air temperature and its uncertainty since 1880: the HadNMAT2 Dataset JGR Atmos. doi: 10.1002/jgrd.50152

HadNMAT2 Dataset JGR Atmos. doi: 10.1002/jgrd.50152 www.metoffice.gov.uk



Gouretski, V., J. Kennedy, T. Boyer, and A. Köhl (2012), Consistent near-surface ocean warming since 1900 in two largely independent observing networks, Geophys. Res. Lett., 39, L19606, doi:<u>10.1029/2012GL052975</u>.



© Crown Copyright 2017, Met Office



A new era of precision climatology?

Met Office A new era of precision climatology?



Fig. 1 Comparison of the different ERSSTv3b, ERSSTv4, buoy-only, and CCI SST monthly anomalies from January 1997 to December 2015, restricting all series to common coverage.

Zeke Hausfather et al. Sci Adv 2017;3:e1601207

Published by AAAS

MAAAS



Met Office Hadley Centre Climate Requirements

Variabl e	Applic ation area	level	Uncert ainty (K)	Horizo ntal resolut ion (km)	Obser ving cycle (h)		
SST	Climate -AOPC	Goal	0.250	10	3		

٩				WMO OSCA	٩R	Details fo	r Variable: Se	a surface	temper	ature - M	ozilla Firefo	x				_ 0	ı x
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit	<u>V</u> ie	w Hi <u>s</u> tory <u>B</u> o	okmarks <u>T</u> o	ols <u>H</u> elp													
w Ass	essing	, the healt \times	🔯 wмo с	SCAR Det 🗙 🌏 E	-Lib	rary	× +										
(()()	www. v	/mo-sat.info/os	car/variable:	s/view/134						ା ୯	ipsl		→ ↓ ·		1 🐵 v 📣	*	≡
BookM	larks	🗸 🌊 Me 🚞 Had	IOBS~ 🗐 BI	ogs~ 💼 Monitoring~	C	oding 🗸 🌊 C	limate Monitori	ng 😏 Twitt	ter 🔣 Go	ogle Schol	ar 🚉 CMA 📱	E-journals	∞ Help IDL	Feedly			
																	^
	ld ≎	Variable	≎ Layer ≎	App Area	¢	Uncertainty	Stability /	Hor	Ver	Obs	Timeliness	Coverage \$	Conf	Val	Source \$		
							decade	Res	Res	Cyc			Level	Date			
	<u>737</u>	Sea surface temperature	Sea surface	Aeronautical Meteorology								Global	tentative	2013-12-05	J van der Meulen		
	444	Sea surface	Sea	Nowcasting / VSRF		0.5 K		5 km		3 h	3 h	Global ocean	firm	2013-04-03	P. Ambrosetti		
		temperature	surface			0.8 K		10 km		6 h	6 h						
						2 K		50 km		24 h	24 h						

Target Requirements

Variable/ Parameter			Horiz Reso	ontal lution	Vertical Resolution		Temporal Resolution			Ac	Accuracy				Stability				
SST		10km		N/A		Daily			0.1 sca	0.1K over 100km scales			Less than 0.03K over 100km scales						
			Thresh old	0.200	500	24		temperature 192 Sea surface temperature	surface Sea surface	Global NWP	0.2 K 0.5 K 0.3 K 0.5 K 1 K	5 km 10 km 5 km 15 km 250 km	12 h 24 h 3 h 24 h 5 d	2 h 3 h 3 h 24 h 5 d	Global ocean firm	2009-02-10	Mafimbo) John Eyre		
	SST stability	GCOS	-	0.03K/ decade	100	decade s		Sea surface temperature '57 Sea surface temperature	sea sudace	SIAP (deprecated)	0.1 K 0.2 K 0.5 K 0.1 K 0.2 K 0.5 K	50 km 85.5 km 250 km 50 km 85.5 km 250 km	3 n 6 h 12 h 3 h 6 h 12 h	3 n 6 h 24 h 3 h 6 h 24 h	Global ocean firm	2009-01-19	Laura Ferranti		

Berry and Kent (2017), Assessing the health of the in situ global surface marine climate observing system. Int. J. Clim., 37:2248-2259. doi:10.1002/joc.4914

Met Office Hadley Centre Summary – raindrops on roses

Most important requirements are qualitative, not quantitative

- Small uncertainties at the smallest and largest scales are very useful, but we will use what we have.
- Uncertainty information we can use and trust:
 - 1. Quantified
 - 2. A scheme for propagating that information to all spatial and temporal scales
 - 3. All components validated: standard deviation, correlations, distributions, stability
 - 4. Limitations clearly expressed
- Validation data. Everywhere
- And whiskers on kittens



Some other references

Carella, G., Morris, A. K. R., Pascal, R. W., Yelland, M. J., Berry, D. I., Morak-Bozzo, S., Merchant, C. J. and Kent, E. C. (2017), Measurements and models of the temperature change of water samples in sea-surface temperature buckets. Q.J.R. Meteorol. Soc., 143: 2198–2209. doi:10.1002/qj.3078

Matthews, J. B. R. and Matthews, J. B (2013): Comparing historical and modern methods of sea surface temperature measurement – Part 2: Field comparison in the central tropical Pacific, Ocean Sci., 9, 695-711, https://doi.org/10.5194/os-9-695-2013, 2013.

Merchant, C. J., et al. (2012), A 20 year independent record of sea surface temperature for climate from Along-Track Scanning Radiometers, J. Geophys. Res., 117, C12013, doi: 10.1029/2012JC008400.

Thorne, P.W., D.E. Parker, J.R. Christy, and C.A. Mears, 2005: <u>UNCERTAINTIES IN CLIMATE TRENDS: Lessons from Upper-Air Temperature</u> <u>Records. Bull. Amer. Meteor. Soc., 86</u>, 1437–1442, <u>https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-86-10-1437</u>

Systematic Observation Requirements for Satellite-based Products for Climate Supplemental details to the satellite-based component of the Implementation Plan for the Global Observing System for Climate in Support of the UNFCCC: 2011 update https://library.wmo.int/opac/doc_num.php?explnum_id=3710

OSCAR WMO Observing System Capability Analysis and Review Tool http://www.wmo-sat.info/oscar/observingrequirements